

**CITY OF NEW HAVEN
CIVIL SERVICE BOARD**

MINUTES OF MEETING

November 16, 2010

<u>Present</u>	<u>Also Present</u>
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Commissioner Frank LaDore• Commissioner Anne Massaro• Commissioner James Williams	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Attorney Kathleen Foster, Asst. Corporation Counsel• Stephen Librandi, Acting Director of Human Resources• Scott Nabel, Public Safety HR Manager• Craig Manemeit, Director Labor Relations
<u>Absent</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Commissioner Daniel DelPrete• Noelia Marcano, Civil Service Secretary	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Asst. Fire Chief Patrick Egan• Fire Marshal Joe Cappucci• Fire Chief Michael Grant• Firefighter Michael Odenwaelder

Commissioner Frank LaDore called the meeting to order at 12:38 pm.

Item #1 Eligibility Lists # 10-18 Deputy Fire Marshall

Scott Nabel read into the record a summary report prepared by Personnel Director Noeila Marcano concerning the entire exam process for Deputy Fire Marshal. Report to be included as part of the minutes of this meeting. At the conclusion of reading the report, Eligibility List #10-18 Deputy Fire Marshal was presented to the Board. Commissioner LaDore asked if there were any questions. After a brief discussion, Commissioner LaDore motioned to Certify Eligibility List #10-18. Commissioner Massaro seconded the motion. All yeas; no abstentions. List #10-18 was certified. A motion was then made by Commissioner Massaro to have List #10-18 be in effect for one year from the date of certification. Commissioner LaDore seconded the motion. All yeas; no abstentions.

Item #2 Eligibility List Removals # 10-17 Fire Fighter

Scott Nabel explained that the individuals to be removed from the list were being removed because they failed to pass the recent CPAT test and/or did not have current CPAT certification. Commissioner LaDore asked Mr. Nabel about CPAT certification. Mr. Nabel explained that it was a standard physical agility test administered by the State of Connecticut. Commissioner LaDore also asked if any one had questions. There being no questions, motioned for removal was made by Commissioner LaDore and seconded by Commissioner Massaro. All yeas; no abstentions. List of names presented were removed from, List #10-17.

***Item Added to Agenda**

Asst. Chief Pat Egan requested an item be added to the agenda. The item to be added is the removal from List #09-02 Fire Inspector/Investigator of an individual who had declined two promotion offers. Motion made by Commissioner LaDore to add the item to the agenda. Motion was seconded by Commissioner Massaro, voted on and approved. There were none opposed.

Asst. Chief Egan identified Michael Blatchley as the candidate to be removed. He explained that Mr. Blatchley has declined two offers of employment (promotion) from this list. Commissioner LaDore inquired if any problem would arise from the removal of this candidate. Asst. Chief Egan responded that since Mr. Blatchley had previously been promoted to Lieutenant, a higher paid position, he doubted Mr. Blatchley would object to the removal. Motion made to remove Michael Blatchley from List # 09-02 by Commissioner LaDore and seconded by Commissioner Massaro. All yeas; no abstentions.

Item #3 Correspondence Received for Civil Service Board

No correspondence had been received to report to the Board, or for the Board to report to Human Resources.

Attorney Kathleen Foster asked the Board to allow Labor Relations Director Craig Manemeit to speak during Corporation Counsel's Litigation Update.

Item #4 Corporation Counsel Litigation Update

Motioned to move into executive session made by Commissioner LaDore, seconded by Commissioner Massaro, voted on and approved. There were none opposed. 12:55pm Executive session begins.

Motion made to come out of executive session at 1:25 PM by Commissioner LaDore, seconded by Commissioner Massaro voted on and approved. There were none opposed.

Item #5 Public Safety Testing Update

Scott Nabel updated the Board concerning activities of the following:

- Board of Police Commissioners Sub-Committee to review the hiring process for entry level police officers;
- Completion of Firefighter paramedic background checks, and that list removals would be forthcoming to the Board at a future meeting;
- Posting activities for the remaining positions in the Fire Marshall Office; and
- Activities with the exam process for the E.M.S Supervisor position.

Commissioner Williams asked for clarification on the Fire Marshall Office positions and Commissioner LaDore asked about the rule of three and Fire Department appointments. All questions were answered to the satisfaction of the Board by Mr. Nabel.

Item #6 Minutes October 28, 2010 Meeting

The minutes of the October meeting were reviewed. Commissioner Massaro motioned to approve the minutes as presented. Commissioner Frank LaDore seconded. All yeas; no abstentions. Minutes approved.

Other Business

The next regular meeting was confirmed to be held on December 14, 2010 at 5:00 PM.

There being no further business to discuss, Commissioner LaDore motioned to adjourn and Commissioner Massaro seconded. Meeting adjourned at 1:40 pm.

Respectfully Submitted,



Stephen Librandi,
Acting Human Resources Director
(In the absence of Noelia Marcano, Civil Service Secretary)

NOTE: For the purpose of compliance with the Freedom of Information Act, these minutes are made available for review subject to later review, revision and approval by the Civil Service Board.

Civil Service Board Approval Date: 12/15/10

In June 2010 advertisement was issued by the City Purchasing Office for bids to conduct the Deputy Fire Marshal promotional exam process. The bid process closed on June 29, 2010.

Three bids were received one from Dr. Catherine Cline from New York, NY, one from Morris & McDaniel, Inc. from Alexandria, Va. and one from Bruce Davey Associates from Glastonbury, CT.

The selected vendor was Bruce Davey Associates. Bruce Davey, PhD has been active in public personnel testing for more than 30 years, including 13 years as Chief Personnel Psychologist for the State of CT and 20 years as president of Bruce Davey Associates. He has been a speaker at numerous national conferences on personnel selection, has authored numerous papers and publications on testing issues, and has served as an expert witness in court cases for plaintiffs, for defendants and as a federal judge's expert. A few of Dr. Davey's accolades received during his career include the State of CT Government Manager's Award, the Bemis Memorial Award for outstanding contributions to the testing field, and his selection as an advisor by the American Psychological Association in the development of its Standards for Educational and Psychological Tests. Dr. Davey has developed many fire and police entry and promotional examinations for the City of New Haven over the last 15+ years.

The City of New Haven's Deputy Fire Marshal exam process commenced in late August 2010 when Bruce Davey conducted an on-site visit to begin the job analysis process, which included New Haven Fire Marshal Joe Cappucci, Fire Chief Michael Grant and Asst Fire Chief Ralph Black. Outcomes of the job analysis process were the study resources and the examination plan. Based on the job analysis results, it was determined that a written test and an oral test following a compensatory model of scoring would be appropriate for this exam process. Consequently, it was decided to weight the written test at 50% and the oral test at 50%.

Results of the job analysis also revealed that there were a number of sources (i.e.: fire codes, regulations, state statutes, etc.) that would normally be “looked up” on an as-needed basis in the job of a deputy fire marshal. Consequently it was found highly appropriate to use an open-book approach for a portion of the written test.

Interested applicants were informed of this promotional opportunity through the job announcement which solicited applications starting September 7, 2010 through September 20, 2010. A total of 5 applications were received. In addition to the customary placement of job announcements on Human Resources’ job posting board as well as the City’s web site, we also arranged to have the job announcement for this promotional opportunity posted in a visible place in all physical locations of the New Haven Fire Department.

Of the 5 applicants, one was disqualified for not having one year of work experience in the Fire Marshal’s Office. This applicant did not avail himself of the administrative process available through disqualification appeal to the Civil Service Board. The process continued with 4 eligible applicants.

A special application packet was provided to all those responding to the job announcement. This packet included the job announcement, the job description, an employment application and a cover letter informing the applicant that once the application is submitted and eligibility determined, a letter would follow providing instructions for obtaining all study materials.

All eligible applicants were sent the aforementioned letter concerning study materials on September 17, 2010. The letter informed of the procedure for collecting all resource material cited on the study list from the Human Resources Office. The study pack included the Fire Chief’s Handbook, IFSTA Essentials of Firefighting, and a photocopied Candidate Study Packet which contained select Directives of the State Fire Marshal’s Office, select City of New Haven Policies, and an Examination Study Guide. For this

exam, all materials needed to study for the test was directly provided to each applicant by the Human Resources Office.

From the point in time that Human Resources notified and made the study materials available, eligible applicants had a period of approximately 6 weeks to prepare for the exam.

On September 29, 2010 the Human Resources Office notified the 4 remaining candidates in writing to inform of the test dates, times and locations and other testing specific instructions. This mailing included the written exam notice and the oral exam notice with instructions on how to call-in and confirm the oral exam appointment time as well as the specified deadline by which to do so.

Of the 4 candidates invited to participate in the testing process, one did not call in by the deadline date, further reducing the pool to 3 candidates.

The written examination was administered on October 25, 2010 and 3 candidates presented for testing. The candidates were given approximately two hours to complete the written exam. The written test was facilitated by City of New Haven Public Safety HR Manager Scott Nabel and test consultant Dr. Davey. All candidates were supplied with two resources to use for the open-book part of the written test. These were the Connecticut Life Safety Code Guidebook and Connecticut General Statutes Chapter 541, which includes Building, Fire and Demolition Codes, Safety of Public and Other Structures, among other things. Seventy items in the written test dealt directly with the materials candidates had been instructed to study and learn prior to the test. Thirty items dealt directly with the open-book materials supplied at the test site.

The oral portion of the examination was administered on November 1, 2010 to the same 3 candidates who took the written test. The oral test was facilitated by test consultant Dr. Davey as well as City of New Haven Public Safety HR Manager Scott Nabel. The oral exam consisted of a variety of structured interview questions with scenarios involving

ethical judgment, difficult inspections, plan reviews, supervision, dealing and communicating effectively with people, etc. All candidates were asked the same questions in the same order. The questions and answers were audio taped.

For security purposes, a sequestering model was used so that when the first candidate was in the process of testing, the second candidate arrived at the test site. When it was time for the second candidate to test, the first candidate was sequestered on site and the third candidate presented for testing. When it was time for the third candidate to test, the first and second candidates were then dismissed from the test site. This method was utilized to prevent any cross-talk prior to testing among the candidate group.

A total of 3 evaluators served on the oral exam panel - a Connecticut municipal fire marshal, a Massachusetts state fire marshal, and a recently retired (but still professionally active) fire marshal from a Massachusetts municipality. There were two white males and an African-American female on the panel.

All evaluators attended mandatory training covering all relevant facets of the scoring procedure along with a discussion and final selection of the questions to be used in the oral test. This training was conducted by Dr. Davey.

New Haven Fire Marshal Joe Cappucci met with the panel during the evaluator training to describe the workings of the New Haven Fire Marshal's Office, the duties of the Deputy Fire Marshal in New Haven, and to answer any questions from the panel. This meeting did not include any discussion concerning the candidates who were to take the test as this would have been highly inappropriate.

Candidates were given feedback forms to complete at the end of the written and oral tests. Essentially, all candidates had two opportunities to provide feedback across two separate days – immediately after completion of the written test and immediately after the oral test. All candidates offered that they thought the exam process was generally fair and related to the job of a Deputy Fire Marshal. All candidates also thought that the

evaluators gave each a fair chance to display their capabilities. One of the three candidates, responding anonymously, said it was the most job-related testing process he had taken since joining NHFD.

All three candidates performed well on the written exam with scores ranging from 75.00 to 84.00. The average or mean score was 80.33. The open-book section of the test had a mean score of 82.50%, which was very similar to the test as a whole. It should be noted that the open-book section of the written exam did not produce a separate score in and of itself. The analysis between performance on the open-book and closed-book sections of the written test only serve to indicate that candidate performance was not particularly advantaged or disadvantaged by providing resources to look up the answers to the test questions contained in the open-book section of the test.

All three candidates did well on the oral examination and passed with scores ranging from 77.04 to 82.41. The scores were very close, which matched the judgments of the panel and consultant that the candidates' qualifications and abilities were very close. However, all three panelists gave their highest scores to the same candidate. The panel exhibited an inter-rater reliability of +.95 out of a possible 1.00.

The written and oral examinations were weighted at 50% each and combined to produce the final list. Naturally, since the written and oral examination scores were relatively close, the final examination scores are also very close, ranging from 76.02 to 82.21.

With only three candidates tested, reliability statistics are not appropriate to report because they are based on too small a group. Test statistics on a group this small are quite unstable and generally misleadingly high or low.

Adverse impact data is also relatively inconclusive with only three candidates. That being said, there were two Hispanic/Latino candidates and one Caucasian candidate. The Hispanic/Latino candidates finished first and third respectively and the Caucasian candidate finished second.

Although the number of candidates makes a discussion of test reliability inconclusive, the data collected to establish the content validity of the test stands on a solid foundation. To summarize:

- a. A thorough job analysis was done and all test material was developed or selected to match the job analysis.

- b. Every question used on the written and oral tests was rated by an expert panel as job-related, accurate and important to include.

- c. The candidates themselves considered both components of the examination to be fair and job-related. There were no candidate complaints or problems raised.

Based on these findings, the consultant submits that the written and oral examination components are fair, valid and defensible.

A list of the final scores was transmitted to the City by Bruce Davey Associates, and Dr. Davey has certified in writing as to the accuracy of all test results.

This promotional examination is job-related in discernable ways, and it was designed and administered consistent with current professional standards. In addition, it is based on, and consistent with the validity evidence provided in the validation report. According to the validation report for this exam, it is reasonable to conclude that scores on this examination reflect job-related competencies.

On this basis, the eligibility list for the position of Deputy Fire Marshal for the New Haven Fire Department is presented for certification.